

tion, I will not fail to do so; but I fear that the great distance such communications will have to be sent before they can reach the frontier will effectually hinder my being able to do so; if even it would be advisable to send any, from the fact of the necessity of being in disguise. Hoping I may be able to succeed in returning with much valuable information, scientific and geographical,

“I have the honour to be, Sir, your obedient Servant,

“GEORGE S. W. HAYWARD.”

“*To the President,
Royal Geographical Society.*”

The following Paper was then read:—

On Trade Routes between Turkestan and India. By Major-General
Sir H. C. RAWLINSON, K.C.B., &c.

SIR HENRY RAWLINSON stated that on more occasions than one he had had the honour of drawing the attention of the Geographical Society to the fact that one of the most valuable results—if not the most valuable result—of all our researches and explorations had been the opening up of new routes for the trade and commerce of nations; and when he thus insisted on the great advantages to commerce, he did not merely allude to it as a means of enriching individual merchants and manufacturers; he looked at it from a far higher point of view. He believed commerce between nations to be a most important instrument in extending civilisation, in promoting peace, and in raising the social condition of the people who engage in it. When two countries stand in the relationship of producer and consumer, their material interests become so identified, that it is almost impossible they should go to war. At any rate, if commercial intercourse be not an absolute antidote to the passion for war, it greatly lessened the danger of collision, and it was in that point of view,—in order to establish a community of interests and thus to consolidate friendly relations,—that he thought it so very desirable to encourage and promote trade between our Indian empire and the nations of Central Asia.

He had put these observations together in order to explain to the meeting the grounds upon which he thought the subject worthy the consideration of the Royal Geographical Society. On two previous occasions he had explained these routes in detail. In the one he had given an exposition of the route of the Pundit from Lhasa to Lake Manasarowar, and in the other had endeavoured to illustrate the journey of Mr. Johnson from Leh to Khotan, and to point out the vast importance of that route. On the present occasion he would first give a few extracts from a Report on the trade routes between Thibet and Central Asia, written by Mr. Forsyth, the Government

Commissioner appointed to superintend the trade of Northern India. The great discovery which Mr. Johnson brought before the notice of geographers was the existence of an open road from Ilchi, round the Kuen-luen Mountains, on to the Changthang Plains, by which, as he asserted, wheel-carriages could pass from the Himalayas direct into the plains of Central Asia. The verification of that route was still the great desideratum in Central Asiatic geography. The present reports confirmed many other statements of Mr. Johnson; but no one yet had been able to pass by that route. If it should be opened, it would be of immense advantage to trade: it would not only offer an open road, but it would very materially shorten the distance and lay open a country, fertile in supplies, to British commerce. Mr. Forsyth had not been able to glean further information regarding the Changthang route, but he had investigated a second route, which Mr. Johnson had previously brought to the notice of the Society. Mr. Forsyth's account proceeded as follows:—

“Two years ago when the question of opening out trade with Ladak and Central Asia was first broached, the state of affairs looked very unpromising.

“The road from Kullu through the outlying British province of Lahoul was scarcely passable for laden animals. As I travelled along Lahoul towards the frontier in 1866, my ears were assailed by continuous complaints of the oppression, exactions, and positive plunder of our traders by the Ladak officials. The recognised duties were so heavy as to become prohibitive, and yet they were mild compared with the illegal cesses extorted by the officials. Whilst I was passing through Lahoul the Maharaja's agents were going from village to village, levying tribute from British subjects for the benefit of their master.

“Beyond the Cashmere border we knew little of what events were taking place, beyond the fact that the Mahomedans had cast off the Chinese yoke, and with it all commercial connexion with the East, and their necessity was evidently our opportunity; but beyond this one encouraging fact, there was little to oppose to the opinion expressed by many that the idea of opening out commerce with Central Asia, by such a line, was purely chimerical.

“Within the short space of two years, however, everything has changed.

“At a comparatively insignificant cost,—not more than 500*l.* having been expended up to the present time,—the road from Kullu to the Ladak border has been rendered passable for laden animals. Rivers have been bridged, steep ascents have been reduced to easy gradients; and for another sum of 500*l.* the whole road will be rendered complete.

“The tribute paid to Cashmere has been abolished; duties have been reduced; oppressions and exactions by Ladak officials have been abandoned; instead of the former system of impressing porters without payment, now, thanks to the Maharaja's liberal orders and to Doctor Cayley's watchfulness, full hire is paid to every man for his services. Joy and gladness now reign throughout Ladak, and the utmost content and gratitude are expressed by the numerous traders to be met with on the road.

“Moreover, instead of being met with opposition by the Maharaja's agents, and with gloomy forebodings as to the destruction of Cashmere monopolies, we now have the Maharaja and all his agents fully alive to the advantage of

free-trade, and each vying with the other in endeavouring to foster and extend the trade which they so lately tried to stifle.

“From Yarkund and Kashgar the traders and travellers bring encouraging accounts of tranquillity and a vigorous Government under Yakub Beg Koosh-begee. And all unite in expressing the earnest desire of the ruler and his people to see trade with Hindostan fully developed.

“Arrived at Leh, it was surprising to observe the crowded state of the bazaar, and the piles of goods brought from Yarkund, Cashmere, and the Punjab, heaped up in the houses or in the court-yards behind.

“Leh is in itself an insignificant place—the chief town of a sparsely populated and poor country, which can maintain little or no trade. But it is important as being the entrepôt of commerce between distant countries, of the vigorous vitality of which ample proof is afforded by the evidence of one’s senses.

“The return of imports and exports about to be furnished by Dr. Cayley will show the state of the market at the present time. It is admitted that the bulk of this season’s merchandise is yet on the road, and as yet the news of the measures taken to facilitate commerce have not been made fully known. Still, it may be noted as a satisfactory commencement that the amount of transactions this year will be about double that of last year.

“This trade is now to be stimulated by the establishment of a fair at Leh in the autumn of every year. And to make this a success it was necessary to arrive at some computation of the demand and supply of the different articles. Time alone can adjust the market properly, but experience of what occurred in establishing the Palampur Fair taught that, in order to guard against disappointment and loss, it was necessary to make and publish some kind of estimate of the articles most likely to be in demand.

“A meeting of traders therefore was held to discuss commercial matters. The conversation was first directed to the road by which Yarkund and Turkestan are generally supplied with goods.

“It appears from the statements of traders, that of late years English goods have been sent in large quantities by Dera Ismael Khan and Peshawur to Bokhara, and thence by Kokan to Kashgar and Yarkund, and have competed successfully with goods brought from Russia. It will be observed, by a glance at the map, that commerce thus takes a very circuitous route, double the time being consumed on the journey which would be taken by the direct route.

“The reason for this which would naturally suggest itself to one’s mind is the unfavourable character of the road over the Himalayas, and this was assumed when inquiry was made of the traders. But it is a fact worthy of notice that they all at once replied, in an emphatic manner, that the cause of the stoppage of trade, by the direct route, was solely the excessive levy of duties by the Cashmere Government. As proof of this, they pointed to the presence in the meeting of many traders who never came to Leh before, but who had now been induced to venture by the announcement of a reduction of duties.

“There was no inclination to make light of the difficulties of the road, but they declared that this would not hinder trade if the fiscal burden were lightened. This fact is important, and gives encouragement; for, as will be shown presently, there is every prospect of our being able to improve the road greatly.

“They next pointed out as a hindrance the difficulty of getting carriage. Owing to the smallness of the traffic along this line, no attempt had been made to provide animals for burden, beyond what could be obtained from the neighbouring shepherds or landowners. A few men at different places kept

ponies and yaks for hire; and as the supply was limited, not only could the prices be unduly raised, but often great and vexatious delays would be caused by enforced halts till animals which had carried onwards a previous batch of merchandise could return.

"Between Leh and Umritsur merchants have to change their carriage five times.

"Now, on the Bokhara and Kokan line it was represented that owing to the wealth of the traders and the greater traffic, no such difficulty exists.

"But this is an evil easily remediable. It is quite evident that, it having been once determined to give a stimulus to trade, it will be worth while for carriage owners to increase their supply. All that is requisite is some kind of guarantee that if more cattle be put on the line, the trade will be sufficient to employ them all.

"Wuzeer Goshaon and Tara Chund at once agreed to take up the subject as regards the road through British territory, and have already commenced arrangements by which carriage will be more plentiful, and cheaper.

"The discussion was then turned to the state of the road between Ladak and Turkestan. Hitherto only one line has been used, which crosses the Karakorum range, and is so exceedingly dangerous and difficult that the traders are obliged to take three spare horses for every one laden, and the calculation is that 25 per cent. of the animals die on the road. The hire of a horse-load for the journey varies from Rs. 42 to Rs. 50. This of course increases the cost of freight enormously. Yet all this difficulty and expense has not prevented the trade from doubling itself this year—the real obstacle, excessive duties, having been removed.

"Similarly, though in less degree, the road between Leh and Hindostan has hitherto been somewhat dangerous and difficult, yet there is a large class of the population of Bussahir, Lahoul, Chumba, and the lower hills, whose living entirely depends on this trade.

"For these persons the improvements now being undertaken by the British Government will render the road so easy that it is hoped that a reduction of 25 per cent. in the cost of carriage may be made.

"As regards the Central Asian trade, it is a matter of the greatest importance that the route which two years ago was pointed to when the subject was first broached, as most likely to prove perfectly easy for laden animals, has now been pronounced by Dr. Cayley, who has travelled over it, to be thoroughly practicable even for laden camels. By the Changchenmo route all the difficult passes of the Karakorum are avoided. Instead of having to march for six days consecutively without finding a blade of grass for their cattle, as over the Karakorum, the traders will find grass, wood, and water, in abundance along the Changchenmo line. Three places only are without grass, and these are not at consecutive halts, so that fodder can be carried without difficulty for one stage where necessary. Thus the towns of Yarkund and Khotan can be reached without any risk of life or injury by an easy undulating road as quickly as by the difficult and inhospitable Karakorum route.

"It is often said by persons not accustomed to travel in these high regions that it is impossible for trade to pass with any ease over such high elevations as 18,000 or 19,000 feet. But the best answer is experience and fact. Trade not only does pass by these routes, but shows a tendency to increase.

"The fact is, that mere elevation within certain limits is no obstacle to progress. When the traveller has reached the plains of Roopshoo or Ladak, he is already at a great elevation, perhaps 15,000 feet. The passes above him do not rise more than 2000 or 3000 feet, and the ascent is generally over an easy slope.

"It is well known that, though four passes have to be crossed between Kullu and Leh, the only one of which traders speak with any fear is the lowest,

the Rohtung. This pass is only 13,000 feet high, but owing to its vicinity to the rainy tracts of Hindostan, its sides are washed by frequent rains into deep ravines, or are carried away by constant avalanches of snow. As we travel further north, and escape the influence of the rains, we find but little snow lying on the passes, and there being less action on the soil, the mountain slopes are scarcely ever cut into ravines.

"The consequence is that from the Bara Lacha Pass to the Changchenmo, the passage over the mountain rising as high as 19,000 feet is only the surmounting of a succession of vast undulations, which offer no obstacle to enterprising traders.

"I may perhaps be asked how, when such an easy road exists, it has never been used. No satisfactory answer has as yet been given, beyond the assertion that for many years the route was forbidden by some former ruler of Ladak. Anyhow, whatever be the reason, we have now only to deal with the fact that the route, though practicable, was closed till now. Whilst I am writing this, a trader, who has ventured over the road, points out a still shorter route for a portion of the way, by which two days' march may be saved; and doubtless if proper persons be employed to survey the whole line, most satisfactory results will be obtained; meanwhile the Yarkund Vakeel, accompanied by a party of Punjab traders and horse loads of Kangra tea, is about to take the Changchenmo route to Yarkund, and thus open the line for future caravans.

"If negotiations were opened with Yakûb Beg Kooshbegee, he has the power, and we are assured has also the will, to secure the direct route by Kogyar to Yarkund from the depredations of the Kunjotee robbers, thus rendering a still shorter line available for trade.

"There is another route between Yarkund, Khotan, and Hindostan, which, passing through a corner of Chinese Tartary, impinges on the Hindostan and Thibet road. This, if opened out, would be still more favourable than the Changchenmo route. But this road can only be opened by a negotiation with the Pekin authorities."

As an instance of the great change in trade that would be effected, take the article of tea. At present the tea was brought down from the interior of China to Shanghae and Canton, and there shipped to India. From Bombay it went to Kurrachee, and from Kurrachee up the Indus into the Punjab, and by the Khyber Pass into Cabul, and from Cabul to Kokan, thence south-east to Kashgar, and from Kashgar it was disseminated through Central Asia; whereas, if the proposed route were opened out, the tea from Assam would come almost direct. Instead of making a circuit of 5000 miles, it would pass over about 500 miles, from Assam through Thibet straight into this very country of Khotan, Yarkand, and Kashgar. The last route to which Mr. Forsyth referred was that which goes round the Karakorum on to the great table-lands in the north-east corner of Little Thibet. From Leh it passed along the Changchenmo valley as far as the River Karakash, so far being the same route as Mr. Johnson followed; the difference afterwards being that Mr. Johnson crossed the Kuen-lun from the head-waters of the Karakash to the town of Ilchi, whilst Mr. Forsyth's route turned off to the left, following the banks of the Karakash all the way to Ilchi.

This was a classical road, because it was the very one described in 'Lalla Rookh,' by which the prince passed from Delhi to Khotan in search of his lady-love. So there was really nothing new in it except the connection which Mr. Johnson's survey enabled us to make with other routes. Mr. Forsyth gave calculations, obtained by actual investigation from the merchants, of the enormous profits made on the export and import trade by this route, with all its present disadvantages. On piece goods it is 50 per cent.

So far for the information supplied by the Report of Mr. Forsyth. He would now give some account of the communications received from Mr. Hayward. This gentleman had volunteered to go out for the purpose of exploring the country between Hindostan and the plains of Central Asia, at his own risk and on his own responsibility. He received some small pecuniary assistance from the Geographical Society by way of outfit; but he was not an officer of the Government, and he would deserve all the more credit if he came back with any great geographical results. Departing in July last from England, he proceeded, on arriving in India, in the first instance, to the vicinity of Peshawur, which would be the natural starting-point for traders leaving British territory. Hitherto the route had followed the high road by Jellalabad to Cabul, and across the Hindu Kush to Kunduz, thence by a circuitous course to Khotan and Kashgar. But it has long been known that there was a direct route from North-Western India to Turkestan. This was brought prominently forward in an article in the 'Quarterly Review' two or three years back, and the authorities for it were then given. But no authentic account of this route had been given by any English traveller. Captain Raverty, a very intelligent and industrious officer, who was a long time stationed at Peshawur, collected a great deal of information concerning the route, which he published in the Bengal Asiatic Society's Journal. Besides this, there was a gentleman still living who, it was believed, had personally traversed all these regions,—a Colonel Gardiner, in the service of the Maharajah of Kashmir. Some day he might, perhaps, put all his experience into writing for the benefit of the world; but at present we only knew of him by report. With the exception of Raverty and Gardiner, he was not aware of any person who had ever travelled along this direct route. It was possible the boy lost among the Afghans, whose adventures were published, some time ago, for the edification of the reading public, might have been there; but if he was, he had left nothing worthy of record. Then, again, there was Captain Larcom, who had travelled a great deal about that country, and might also have traversed portions of this route; and Mr. Hayward had been in the vicinity, but not

actually in the valley. In 1842 he himself remembered riding with a party once to the bank of the river at Jellalabad, for the purpose of examining some remarkable Buddhist antiquities, and they were then exactly in front of this great valley, which opened out on the river near Jellalabad and ran right up into the heart of the mountains. The people on the spot told him, "This is the gate of Turkestan," it was so well known in the country to be the really natural access from the low country of the valley of the Indus into the great plains of Central Asia. Although we made several attempts during our occupation of Afghanistan to penetrate into that valley, we never succeeded beyond a very short distance; and up to the present time he believed no European had ever been up there, at any rate we had no account of it. Mr. Hayward's special object was to traverse this valley. Owing to local circumstances, when he arrived there he found it impossible to carry out that plan. But he had obtained the very best substitute for personal observations: he had obtained a very elaborate itinerary of the route from a Yarkand merchant, who had been in the habit of following it, who seemed to have been a very observant traveller, and who put down in detail all the physical characteristics of the route; from that Itinerary Mr. Hayward had constructed a very excellent map. He held in his hand the Itinerary translated into English. This great natural route, which, it was asserted, was practicable throughout to laden carts—he believed there was no other pass over the mountains between India and Central Asia which was at all in the same category—this direct route passed from Jellalabad up the valley and along the river up to its source; and from this point by a very easy road over the Hindu Kush, the Chitral Pass, into the valley of the Oxus. Once there, your difficulties are over. There were other roads into the Chitral Valley from Peshawur, without proceeding to Jellalabad; one by the Swat Valley, and another by Bajour. The great matter was to reach the Chitral Valley, by which the readiest access was obtained over the lofty mountain-range into the valley of the Oxus. Two passes over the Hindu Kush were described in the Itinerary: one, north of the town of Chitral, the "Kotah Darah," which was the more difficult route; the other straight up to the head of the Chitral Valley, much the more easy, and, as stated in the Itinerary, practicable for laden carts. After giving all the stages of the route in detail up the valley, until the pass at the top of it is reached, the author said:—

"At the pass is a hot spring and a lake, which is at times closed by avalanches from the pass two or three years continuously, after which it bursts forth in a torrent that rises in the pass and runs about a mile to the west of the lake. The boundary of Chitral ends here."

He went on to describe several fertile tracts in the upper valley of the Oxus—fertile for a limited population, but not by any means favourable for the march of an army.

In connection with the valley of the Oxus, he must call attention to a subject of very great interest with regard to this Itinerary. The route from Western Asia to China, through Persia and along the north of the Hindu Caucasus, had been a great route of commerce from a remote antiquity. It was laid down by Ptolemy and all geographers since his time, but never with any minuteness. In the middle ages, Marco Polo travelled by it; after him the only traveller who ever described it in any detail was the Portuguese missionary, Benedict Goetz. The route of Goetz had always been a difficult subject of investigation. Colonel Yule, who had studied the subject of mediæval routes overland to China, and had recently published his inquiries in two volumes, entitled 'Cathay, and the Way Thither,' was always puzzled by it. In short, we should never have been able to understand it without such recent information as that afforded by this Itinerary obtained by Mr. Hayward. The Yarkand merchant travelled along the same road as Goetz, following the route, stage by stage, and the identifications of places throughout were placed beyond doubt. The names of the places which occur in Goetz and in this Itinerary were quite sufficiently similar to establish the identity of the route.

Sir Henry Rawlinson said he would conclude his observations on this important geographical document by reading Mr. Hayward's remarks upon it:—

"As these routes are taken from verbal information, supplied to the Punjab Government by a Yarkand merchant, I believe they are to be relied on, in so far as the general description of the roads and countries is given. But the distances are not reliable, nor can the accompanying rough map be considered so, speaking geographically. If, as is stated, the pass at the head of the Chitral Valley is so easy that laden carts can traverse it, this route must then be considered as not only the most direct road from Peshawur to Yarkand (and Badakshan), but also as the easier for trading purposes. Pundit Munphool, however, states 'that the trade through Chitral is confined to certain adventurous Afghans alone, and that natives of Yarkand seldom traverse this route.'

"The road being subject also to incursions of the Kafiristan tribes, is, perhaps, on that account avoided by the Yarkand merchants, who prefer the longer route via Kashgar, Kokan, Bokhara, and through Afghanistan, or through Ladakh and Kashmir.

"In conversation with a Moonshee, by name Mahomed Hussain (and who accompanied Pundit Munphool to Badakshan), I learn that the Chitral Valley is well cultivated, great quantities of rice and Indian corn are grown, and it is thickly inhabited. The Khan of Chitral also professes favourable views towards the Indian Government. He, however, carries on an extensive slave-trade with Badakshan. The Sia-push Kafirs of Kafiristan, kidnapped or forcibly seized by him from the adjacent country of Kafiristan, also persons of the Kalash Dangiri and Bashghali tribes, idolaters living in the Chitral territory, people of the Sheeah-sects who are convicted of any crime, and the children of

culprits from these classes, are all sold by the Chitral ruler to the Badakis, Uakhis (of Uakhan), and Shighnis (of Shighnan), by whom they are taken to Bokhara and Eastern Turkestan. The price of slaves in Chitral varies from 25 tillas (about 15*l.*) to 12 tillas (about 7*l.*)."

A Report had also been received by the Society, furnished by Munphool Meer Moonshee, a pundit who served as an agent sent by the Government into these countries. He had described them pretty much in the same terms as the merchant whose Itinerary had been copied by Mr. Hayward. He showed that the reason why this route was not generally followed was on account of robbers among the hill-tribes. It was curious to find that the tribe which committed the greatest atrocities were called the Atkash—the very tribe who attacked Benedict Goetz. That very tribe, who at present held the passes and attacked travellers, were described as having blue eyes and light hair, exactly as Benedict Goetz remarked of those Atkash robbers who attacked him.

If Mr. Hayward succeeded in reaching Yarkand and penetrating into the Pamir Steppe, he would be doing great service to science; for, as Lord Strangford would be able to explain, the geography of that part of Asia had been confused and mystified beyond all conception by a very singular network of ingenious forgery or romance. It certainly was the case that both English and Russian geographers had had to contend, for many years past, with a fabulous system of geography in reference to these regions. There was a certain paper in the archives of the Russian Government which had been followed by all Russian geographers; and a certain voluminous document was also in the archives of the British Government, which many years ago had been submitted to the elder Mr. Arrowsmith, and served as the foundation of that part of his map of Central Asia, which had been considered as a standard authority. Both these documents were utter forgeries; the product of the ingenious imagination of a clever man—a man well acquainted with the subject, but who invented the Itineraries and actually extemporised a system of geography. The Russian document was stated to be the Travels of a certain Georg Ludwig Von —, supposed to have been a doctor in the English service, who was sent out into Central Asia to buy horses in a region where there was no possibility of getting horses. The manuscript volume which we had in the Foreign Office was supposed to be the journal of a Commission sent by the Emperor of Russia to survey our frontiers—a commission which never had any existence. Thanks to this Itinerary, we were now able to expose the whole thing and to test the authenticity of these Memoirs.

Sir Henry Rawlinson concluded as follows:—

And now, sir, although I entirely approve of the rule which excludes from our deliberations all discussion on political matters, I cannot avoid saying a few words on the Russo-Indian question; because a misconception, as I think, of the true bearing of this question has given rise to much of that discouragement with which we have hitherto had to contend in pushing our trade and geographical exploration into Central Asia. Let me say, in the first place, that I entirely agree with a late writer in the 'Edinburgh Review,' that the wildest Russophobic could never contemplate danger to India from beyond the chains of the Kuen-lun and Karakorum (to which I would also add the Hindu Kush). Although the routes over these chains, to which I have already drawn attention, may be perfectly practicable for commerce, they are quite impracticable to the march of an army, not on account of physical difficulties, but from the want of supplies; and the best practical proof of this is that in all history there is no instance of an invader having ever attempted to descend upon India, either by the Polu or Changchenmo route from Eastern Turkestan, or by the Chitral route from the valley of the Oxus. No, sir, if in the fulness of time Russia ever does attempt an approach to, or a demonstration against India, her line of advance will not lie over any of the passes of the great Northern Range of the India Caucasus, but it will follow what might be denominated, in the language of mathematicians, the line of the least resistance, which runs from the south-east corner of the Caspian, by Meshed, Herat, and Candahar; and, in reference to that line, I will only further say, that so long as we preserve our present friendly relations with the Persians and Afghans—so long, that is, as we all offer a combined resistance—any such military advance is simply impossible. But, sir, to consider the general question, let us take the French alliance for an example. Now, there is certainly a possibility that, under very exceptional circumstances, the French at some future period may attempt an invasion of this island; but does such a possible remote contingency in any way affect our relations with that power? Do we not in the mean time maintain the closest alliance with the French, political and commercial? And why, then, are we to be deterred from meeting Russia fairly and frankly in Central Asia, merely because in the time of our children, or our children's children, under some equally exceptional circumstances, we may be engaged in hostilities with that power, in the course of which she may find it expedient to make a demonstration against India? No, sir, do not let us any longer be deterred by a fear of entanglement with Russia from pushing our legitimate trade into the countries intermediate between Russia and India. If Russia has her Consuls established for the protection of her v Tokan, at

Kashgar, and at Kuldja, let us also have our Consuls settled at Ilchi, at Yarkand, at Balkh, and at Herat—at all the great outlets of our commerce with Central Asia. I can see no reason, indeed, why the Russians and English should not go on, hand-in-hand, in developing the trade and resources of the countries intermediate between the two empires. The sooner, at any rate, that we can remove the mutual mistrust and reserve which has hitherto hampered commercial enterprise and checked geographical discovery, the better; and this Society, which from its numbers and intelligence has now become a power in the State, may very materially aid the good work by the expression of its views in its favour. I trust, therefore, that if any discussion arises on the points which I have brought before the meeting, this practical result will be kept steadily in view.

The PRESIDENT, in returning thanks to Sir Henry Rawlinson, said he entirely coincided in the sentiment which he had put forward in the last sentences he had read. He would now call upon Lord Strangford to offer his observations.

LORD STRANGFORD addressed himself more particularly to the remark of Sir Henry Rawlinson,—that there is a true and a false geography of these countries. The true geography had grown piece by piece, in a way that was highly satisfactory to contemplate. It may be said to have had for its first beginning in modern and scientific times, the well-known Itinerary of Izzet Ullah, despatched on special service of inquiry by Moorcroft, taken together with the map of Lieutenant Macartney, at the end of Elphinstone's work, which was based on an examination of all records in India accessible at the beginning of the century. From that period down to this very last Itinerary the successive authorities on this subject mutually corroborated one another in even minor details, and are nowhere in any material opposition. We had now come into possession of excellent itineraries; we had obtained a correct and comprehensive general scheme of the whole country between the head-waters of the Oxus—a country perhaps more easily defined hydrographically than in any other way. Roughly speaking, this consists, working from east to west, of the Gilgit River, the branches of the Swat River, the long Chitral Valley, the streams of Kafiristan tributary to the Cabul River, and, north of the mountains, the various feeders, great and small, of the Oxus. The narrative of Captain Wood is unquestionably the chief and most classical account of this region, as he personally visited the very heart of it. By the side of it may be ranked, as establishing fixed points in a district which is the least visited of all, the recent narrative and Itinerary of Abdul Mejeed, the meritorious Afghan Mollah, on whose behalf, it is to be remembered, he (Lord Strangford) had received the award of a gold watch two years ago. As a third classic record of fixed points must be taken the important series of papers contributed by Captain Raverty from native information, giving a fully detailed account of the Chitral Valley, the Swat Valley, and, lastly, of that unknown, but most fascinating, region which ethnologically was the most interesting of all, the country of the Siyah Pūsh Kafirs,—infidels who had so surprisingly maintained their independence against the surrounding swarms of Mahomedans, the men with blue eyes and fair hair, who used chairs and tables, and were supposed to be descendants of the Bactrian Greeks. By the side of all this result of genuine work, we have geographical names and positions on our maps which no one has ever found in the countries themselves, and which there has hitherto been no way of accounting for. Sir Henry Rawlinson had given, in his brief sketch, the essential outline of this. He had already exposed the

extraordinary story of the German Baron Ludwig Von — two years ago: a story not only spurious, but absurdly so, when brought to the test on ground, like Cashmere, fully within our own geographical competence to speak positively. Now, meditating upon this, he happened to fall across a note in the 'Quarterly Review,' to the effect that there existed in the archives of our Foreign Office a memorandum in manuscript on Central Asia by the late Julius Klaproth, containing a whole mass of geographical and miscellaneous information. He applied to Lord Stanley for permission to see this manuscript. On examining it, as yet only with special reference to the Baron, he found, bound up with this manuscript, a map which contained Kashmir as its centre, in which the whole scheme of the geography of Kashmir, and the fictitious local nomenclature of Kashmir, were given exactly as they are in the hypothetical Baron's map. Now this proved, of necessity, either that Klaproth had access to the Russian archives, from which the Baron's memorandum was disinterred by Veniukoff in 1861, or else that Klaproth was the actual fabricator of that book himself, and so was himself neither more nor less than the Baron. In the paper introducing the Baron's story, translated and printed in our 'Journal' for 1866, it will be remembered that Veniukoff described his having made another simultaneous discovery—the discovery of a Chinese Itinerary passing through the very same region, more or less, and drawn up with great elaboration, presented to the Russians by the same Klaproth. Now, as far as the names from this came out through the above and the later papers of Veniukoff, they were identical with the names contained in the manuscript of Klaproth. That manuscript, as beheld in the form which the Foreign Office acquired, purported to be the personal narrative and the geographical results of a *Russian* expedition, which was sent into Central Asia as far south as our Indian frontier by the Emperor Paul, about the year 1801 or 1802. So that, in point of fact, the result of the examination was that the geographical matter given by Klaproth to the Russians as Chinese, was given by him to us as the result of an alleged Russian expedition by the Emperor Paul. He was not going into the details of this parallel for the present, it was sufficient to state the general result. These Russians went, first of all, to the city of Ili, from Ili to Yarkand, from Yarkand south by a road which does duty for the Karakorum Pass, but which is cast in an altogether different mould. This last was entirely fabricated, and would be exposed, he hoped, on a future occasion by himself. By this way they got down to Dingang, a large town on the River Gher-Sind, thence along this ingenious double of the true Indus over a watershed in one or two days' march through the country of the pagan Siyah Pūsh to the head-waters of a river called Santadru, flowing into the Badakshan branch of the Oxus, and then by Dairim, Bolor, Ergu, and divers other strange places, which are either something quite different from the assigned position, or else are nothing at all. Lord Palmerston gave permission to Mr. Arrowsmith to study this manuscript for geographical purposes in 1834; and Mr. Arrowsmith thus came to embody in his own map some of these erroneous or fictitious positions, which have in this way obtained standing-room on subsequent maps. He was not, of course, to be blamed for doing so. But those positions had ever since occupied a certain place in our maps. They had only been slowly and gradually eliminated in our recent maps, more particularly the map of Colonel Cooke at the War Office, and the map of Colonel Walker at Calcutta, who, it may be said incidentally, had been the first to give the proper position and dimensions to the great Pamir upland, and had naturally eliminated most of those false positions, by dint of not finding any vouchers for them anywhere. But in the latest map of Petermann, and elsewhere, since this old matter turned up anew in the shape of fresh Russian discoveries, they had regained their footing in continental maps, the Russians not being aware of the circumstances in which they had first made their appearance, or of the fact that Klaproth had presented himself in two distinct characters to the Russian and

the English authorities. The date of our receiving it was at the time when Canning was Foreign Minister in 1824. He would now briefly read the heads of his general conclusion upon the subject :—

1. That the geographical matter, represented in the Klaproth MS. as having been acquired through a Russian survey, is identical with that exhibited in the memoir recently discovered at St. Petersburg by Veniukoff, purporting to be a Chinese Itinerary translated and contributed by the same Klaproth, in so far as the latter has been made public.

2. This geographical matter is altogether spurious in the journey from Yarkand southwards and round through Badakshan to Kokan.

3. The map of Macartney seems to have entered to some extent into its fabrication, and certainly formed the actual groundwork of the parallel falsification of the hypothetical Baron Ludwig von —, as far as the neighbourhood of Cashmere is concerned.

4. A map of Klaproth's own construction, bound up in this volume, being independent of the above Russian expedition, represents Cashmere under the nomenclature and conformation of the Baron. This circumstance proves either that Klaproth had access to the Russian archives, from which the Baron's tale has lately been recovered in an unspecified way, or that he actually fabricated it. This last view is in some measure supported by the philological similarity between the two sets of fictitious names which have the same aspect, just as the local names in 'Gulliver's Travels' have the same philological air.

5. In criticising this paper, no margin can be left to the score of uncertain knowledge, as its geography claims to be the fixed result of actual *bonâ fide* observation along the whole line of travels. It is fair to assume, however, that Klaproth did believe himself to be representing the general state of the country in so far as he knew it, and that he only knew himself to be falsifying, or rather mystifying, when he employed fictitious machinery for his knowledge by conveying it in the dramatic form of the narrative of a Russian expedition.

They would see by this that, thanks to the liberal permission accorded him by Lord Stanley, he had brought down two birds with one stone—the sham Baron's narrative, and the sham Itinerary of the expedition, which is also a Chinese itinerary: this last, possibly, having a genuine Chinese groundwork, but, at all events, asserting false geography when within the scope of our knowledge.

The PRESIDENT: Also your belief that the Russians did never send an expedition?

Lord STRANGFORD really had no means of knowing whether the Russians did or did not send an expedition; but, as he took occasion to mention to Lord Stanley, in regard to the Emperor Paul being capable of having sent one, it was known as a matter of history that he was at one time on bad terms with ourselves, and that the Russians did certainly try at that time to feel their way as much as they could towards India. Consequently there could be no delicacy in adverting to the then state of things, especially as it was doubtful, as matter of fact, whether the Emperor Paul did send any expedition or not. In conclusion, his Lordship said he hoped he should soon be able to read a paper on the subject.

The PRESIDENT observed that Lord Strangford should have a whole evening to himself on this most important subject. He then requested Sir Bartle Frere, late Governor of Bombay, to say a few words upon the general subject of the trade-routes.

Sir BARTLE FRERE said, after having listened to two such great masters of the science of Geography as Sir Henry Rawlinson and Lord Strangford, at that late hour of the evening it would rather be a work of supererogation to attempt to add anything to the information they had given. They had lifted a corner of the veil which had so long concealed the truth concerning these regions.

He thought we should all go to bed content to have learned one great truth this evening—that it is in the power of a falsehood in science to keep asunder great nations, and that it is in the power of men of science and literature to remove that misapprehension, and to bring great nations together.

A second Paper was the following:—

2. *A Journey to the Western Portion of the Tian-Shan Range, from the Western Limits of the Trans-Ili Region.* By N. A. SEVERTSOFF. Translated from the Russian by ROBERT MICHELL, Esq., F.R.G.S.

This Memoir will be published entire in the 'Journal,' vol. xxxix.

Second Meeting, 23rd Nov., 1868.

[Held in the Theatre of the ROYAL INSTITUTION, by permission of the PRESIDENT and MANAGERS.]

SIR RODERICK I. MURCHISON, BART., K.C.B., PRESIDENT, in the Chair.

PRESENTATIONS.—*A. T. Bowser, Esq.; Henry Blanc, Esq., M.D.; Lieutenant W. F. Prideaux.*

ELECTIONS.—*Henry Blanc, Esq., M.D., &c.; William Bowly, Esq.; Henry Bright, Esq.; George Phillips Bevan, Esq.; the Hon. Felix Bedingfield (Colonial Secretary, Mauritius); William Clarke, Esq., M.I.C.E.; Lieutenant Thomas Tupper Carter, R.E.; Alexander Croll, Esq.; A. A. Hay Currie, Esq., C.E.; William Pirie Duff, Esq.; John Douglas, Esq.; Captain William H. Mailland Dougal, R.N.; George W. Davidson, Esq., M.A., M.D., &c.; Rev. Allen Thomas Edwards, M.A.; Lieutenant-Colonel G. M. B. Farquharson; Alexander Frater, Esq. (First Assistant in the Canton Consulate); Richard Henry Glyn, Esq.; Lieutenant Thomas Hungerford Holdich, R.E.; James Lawrie, Esq.; Robert P. Linton, Esq. (Surgeon-Major, H. M. Indian Navy); James L. Lobley, Esq., F.G.S.; Robert McLaren, Esq.; Major F. A. Millingen; Lord Ormathwaite; Thomas S. Owden, Esq.; Lieutenant W. F. Prideaux (Bombay Staff Corps); Henry Rose, Esq.; Major-General Sir Charles Staveley, K.C.B.; Major Robert Murdoch Smith, R.E.; M. J. de Salles; Charles Henry Walker, Esq.; Rev. Thomas Whitby, M.A.; Richard Henry Wood Esq., F.S.A.; Captain John Wood (late I.N.).*

ACCESSIONS TO THE LIBRARY FROM NOVEMBER 9TH TO 23RD. — *Donations.*—'The Parana: Incidents of the Paraguayan War, &c., from 1861 to 1868.' By T. J. Hutchinson. Donor, the author. 'Compte-Rendu à propos de la Guerre du Paraguay.' Par M. Hutchinson. Donor, the author. 'The Non-Aryan Languages of India and High